

Permission of reservation at the time of Innocent Imams (PBUTH) and the necessity of retrieval of narratives which were told in the conditions of reservation

Tayebeh Haji Mohammadi^{1,*}, Dr. Seyyedeh Fatemeh Hashemi²

¹MA. Student, Department of Qur'an and Hadith Sciences, Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran

²Assistant professor, Department of Qur'an and Hadith Sciences, Islamic Azad University, Central Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran

Abstract: Reservation is a rational and religious technique to save Shia people's life and honor while they maintain their main religious beliefs. The legitimacy of reservation has explicitly been stated in the Qur'an and hadith, hence Imams ordered Shiites to have reservation in necessary occasions against their opponents. Innocent Imam would order to have reservation or not; this action was fulfilled at the presence of Imam. Since the hadith which was told under the conditions of reservation could be an excuse for the opponents. Therefore regarding cognition of hadith and the conditions in which hadith was told, we should study hadith that was told with reservation.

Key words: *Reservation; Permission of reservation; Reservation and Shiite Imams; Retrieval of narratives told in the conditions of reservation*

1. Introduction

One of the considerable issues in studying beliefs, jurisprudence, and Shiite hadith is the investigation of the role that can be imagined for the element of reservation and this issue is taken into consideration because reservation is mentioned in analyzing most of the narratives and juridical Fatwa(s). On the other hand, although reservation is the Quranic and Islamic principle, Sunni scholars have mostly restricted it to Shiite and thereby they have let out a stream of invective and criticism toward this religion. Of course Shiite scholars have responded to their criticisms. Discussion of reservation and the investigation of its positive and negative effect on Shiite hadith are due to reservation in the political history of Shiite and the Shiite's life in oppressive conditions. Shiites have used this principle in the long centuries due to maintaining their current existence and scientific legacies. It seems necessary to mention three points:

1) Some narratives of Shiite were told and published in reservation and camouflage. It means that imams have presented subjects privately in the collection of their companions, and their students have carefully rewritten the traditions and they have transferred to the others away from strangers. This matter is one of the advantages of traditions of Shiite.

2) Since Imam lived in oppressive conditions, he had reservation in expressing real fatwa and refused to express his real opinion when somebody referred to him. And his opinions which were in accordance with jurisprudence and Sunni fatwa were accessible to Shiite too.

2. The concept of reservation

Reservation lexically originates from the words "maddeh" and (qayeh) which means care and protection (Isfahani). Reservation has been used in the meaning of "hear", "volition" and "warning" in Arabic (Anis et al 2/105). Regarding religious terminology it means expressing words and doing action unlike inner beliefs in order to save life, repel any hurt to property and maintaining honor and current existence (Moghnieh/ 49). According to terminology of jurists, reservation means innocent Imam expresses hadith in favor of public (Ayashi, 12/251, Al tafsir al mansoub el al imam al askari, 356, sadouq, maani al akhbar, 386, Mohaddes Qomi, 4/736).

3. Permission of reservation

There is a consensus among Shiites regarding the permission of reservation. Regarding permission of reservation, Imams have referred to some verses of Quran and narratives. According to Holy Quran: "whosoever disbelieves in Allah after believing except he who is forced while his heart remains in his belief but he who opens his chest for disbelief, shall receive the anger of Allah and for such awaits a mighty punishment" (Al-nahl, 106). In this verse which was revealed at Mecca, God confirmed the reservation of Ammar Yasir who blasphemed in order to save his life (Tabarsi, 6/597). And also the God says: "their wage shall be given them twice,

* Corresponding Author.

because they have endured patiently" (Al-qesas 54). God says: the believers should not take the unbelievers as guides in preference to the believers he who does this does not belong to Allah in anything, unless you have a fear of them. Allah warns you to be cautious of him; the arrival is to Allah (AL-Imran-28). This holy verse has been revealed in Medina about those who were confederate with the Jewish (Fakhr Razi, 8/11). The Muslims have been let have friendly relationship and leave hostility with unbelievers (polytheist or people of the book) and have a peaceful life with them when they feel fear of them (Tabatabaei, 2/218). It has also been referred to a hadith which has been expressed by Abi Abdullah who said: "if you understand one hadith, it is better than you narrate one thousands Hadith; neither of you becomes jurist unless you find out the gist of our words because every word of our speech is interpretable to seventy aspect that we are aware of them". His purpose is those of cases which have been expressed ambiguously and with the reservation (Saduq, 2/10). The issue of reservation has been confirmed through the consensus of Shiite community and some traditions so that there is no need for logical reason. Imams had reservation in their time due to the oppressors and tyrannous caliphs as Imam Reza (AS) said: (nine out of ten part of religion is in reservation (Kuleyni, 2/218). And Imam Reza said: (i.e.: whoever does not have reservation, he doesn't have religion (same). Abu Amru kanani narrates from Abi Abdullah who said: "O Abu Amru tell me if I quote you a hadith or I give you a fatwa, afterwards you come to me and you ask me about it and I state unlike previous hadith or fatwa, which one of them do you act? I said that I accept a tradition that is newer and I'll give up another. Imam said: O Abu Amru you are right; God likes hidden worship; swear to God if you do it, it is better both for me and you. Allah prohibits everything in His religion for us and for you except reservation (Majlesi, 4/247). According to some traditions, Muslims have been allowed to have reservation and, if necessary, in addition they were permitted to do reservation in minutiae of religion other than basic principles of religion (Marouf Hassani, 327). Some Shi'a sects such as Zaidi and the public opposed to Imamieh in terms of the permission of reservation (Ali Akbar ghaffari sefat / 81). And they have said that the Prophet and the Imams have been appointed to express the religious commandments based on Shia belief, so if they fear of enemies and do not express the truth of religious commandment and dare not to express them, what is the use of their appointment? In addition there will be no trust to their statement! Because it is likely to express opposition in the reservation, though Imamieh say that Imam is away from any fault, as far as his statement is a proof, does the reservation cause his words to be distrusted? It has been responded to this problem that the reservation is only in conflicting narratives and thus don't cause secrecy and lack of expression. In spite of reservation, trust to their words isn't lost, because

they have implicitly pointed to the reservation and they have expressed actual commandment elsewhere so that it can remove any doubt. The reservation is not in conflict with chastity. Since if Imam gives fatwa in reservation while it is in accordance with the true order of God, it won't stop expressing of truth in any other circumstances, but if he isn't innocent, he may make a mistake in ordering; may not understand the truth; may not take care of it and thus he may act mistakenly whereas if he understands, there may be a risk in the second order rather than in the first sentence or in both of them (Sharani, 398).

4. Studding reservation at the time of Imams (AS)

Perhaps those who are unaware of the political history of Shiite do not understand the necessity of philosophy of reservation among Shiites and criticize them because of reservation. But if we consider some cruelties which Shiites have tolerated, then we can say how they have maintained their heritage and saved their own life in the light of reservation. Since oppressive governments of Bani-Abbas and Bani-Umayyeh in different periods of time were against Shiites and they had decided to kill them, following the orders of the Quran, they did reservation and hid their true beliefs and thus they saved their life and other Muslims in those circumstances. As an instance the uprising of Imam Ali (AS) and the Prophet (PBUH) at the beginning of the mission and his five-year reign was in reservation. After the tragic incident of Karbala, no security remained for the Shiites in Islamic lands and henceforth the necessity of reservation became apparent among Shiites especially since the time of Imam Baqir (AS) the religion of Shiite left its form of heroic group and turned into a scientific school and the use of reservation was emphasized to allow students of this religion to survive and leave the message of this school to the next generation (Behbudi, 1/218). Otherwise, there was no other way for the Shiites and their legacies to survive. The following narratives show the need for reservation in the conditions of oppression and hardships of Shiites and Shia Imams. It has been narrated that a person came to Imam Sajjad (AS) and asked: "o prophet's son how is everything with you and how do you spend your time?" he replied: "it is something like that of the Israelites who spent time within the community of Pharaoh. They killed children, they took women as slaves. Now people with insult to our Seyyed (Imam Ali) get closer to enemies (Ibn Sa'd, 5/170). So at the time of Imam Sadiq (AS) despite usual freedom, oppression against Shiites wasn't removed and Imam continuously recommended them to have reservation and keep secretes. Hemad ibn Vahed laham Kofi says: "I confronted on the way with Abu Abdullah Sadiq (AS) but I turned my face and went; then after a time I came to Imam and said: Dear Sir I confront you but I turn my face and go ahead lest I may cause problems and difficulties for you. Abu Abdullah (AS) said: God bless you (Kuleyni,

2/219). The more extent the foundations of the Abbasian caliphate were stronger, the more pressure and repression against Shia Muslims also increased so that the Shiites had perfect caution when they came to Imam Sadiq (AS). Hisham ibn salem says: We sent a message to Imam Sadiq (AS) that we as a group of Kofi Shiites are going to farewell and leave Medina and he answered: leave one by one or two by two (Same reference). The strangulation in the community of that time not only would threaten their life and their property, but also it would make difficult quoting hadith and their testimony. In such a situation, it was difficult not only for the Shiites, but also for anyone who wanted to narrate from Imams and reservation was an obligatory issue. Shiites also had been weakened during the time of Imam Kazim (AS) because of uprising of Ismaeeliyah and pressure of Abbasi. So using the policy of reservation, Imam (AS) banned his followers from any armed uprising. The use of reservation by Shiites was due to force and strangulation of Sunni caliphs and rulers and the hypocrisy of Shiites. So as soon as the pressure of Sunnis was reduced towards Shiites, the use of reservation has been permitted (Mughniyeh, 182).

4. Studying some of the traditions which have been expressed in the conditions of reservation and how to retrieve them

Identify those cases which involve reservation, it must be noted that all or some of them are conflicting. So whatever is in accordance with public fatwa and contrary to what our companions have agreed upon, it becomes clear that the case involved in reservation. However, diagnosing which one is in reservation requires knowledge of history and knowledge of public orders and the time of giving Fatwa or expressing narrative which was common (i.e. when their fatwa at the time of expressing narratives.) (Mamghani, 40). We mention some of these narratives and their retrievals as an instance Imad ibn Mosa narrates from Imam Sadiq (AS):

Imam Sadiq was asked a man performs all the actions of ablution except for the feet that he washes thoroughly with water instead of anointing. He said: It is true and enough (Tousi, 1/44). It is clear that taking ablution in this way is not true and according to several narratives, as well as the lack of consensus among Shiites proves it as untrue. Hence traditionists and jurists like Sheykh Tousi consider it as reservation. In another hadith, Ali ibn Saeed Basari says: "I said to Imam Sadiq I have communication with the tribe Bany Uady; people in the mosque, muezzin and Imam of the congregation are Ottoman and they detest you and Shiites. When I go there, Can I follow Imam of the congregation in prayer, Imam answered: "Follow him and do what you heard; if you arrive in Basra, Fozail ibn yasar will ask you in this regard. Say my fatwa to Fozail ibn yasar but act what he will tell you and put aside my words. Ali ibn Saeed says: I got into Basra and I told Fozail what Imam talked about and he said: "Imam is aware of what he said, but I heard from him and his

father who said that we shouldn't follow Nasibi in prayer and we must say our prayers as if we say our prayers alone. Ali ibn Saeed said, I did what Fozail ibn yasar said and I gave up the speech of Imam Sadiq (Same reference 3/27). In another hadith, Imam had reservation without the presence of anybody. Zareh has narrated that Hamran quoted that Imam Sadiq (AS) said: In the book of Imam Ali (as) who said that when they said the Prayer of congregation, say your prayer with them. Zareh said: I told Hmran it is not possible, Imam has had reservation. Do I follow the enemy? Hmran said: How is it possible for him to have reservation while I did not ask him? He began to speak and said to me: in the book of Imam Ali (AS) who said that when they said the Prayer of congregation, say your prayer with them, how is it possible for him to have had reservation? Zareh said: I told Hamran he has had a reservation, and such a fatwa is not permitted. One day I came to Imam Sadiq (AS) and Hamran said to Imam Sadiq: the Hadith you narrated from the book of Imam Ali (AS), I quoted to Zareh, but he told that such a thing is impossible, and the enemy of God is unfaithful. So I shouldn't follow him and shouldn't say my pray beside him. Imam Sadiq (AS) said: it is stated in the Book of Imam Ali (AS) that when they said the Prayer of congregation, say your prayer with them but don't get up until you say two other postures. I told: you mean that I pray four postures for myself and I mustn't follow him? He replied: Yes and Zareh said: so Imam got silent; we left there; Hamran became quiet too and we were both happy (Same reference, 28).

In another hadith about eating the sacrificed animal of Nasebi[†] and Harvari[‡]

I asked Imam Sadiq (AS) about eating sacrificed animal of Harvari and Marjaee and Imam said: Eat it and be certain about it (Majlesi 16/293). Muhaqqeq Ardabili has said that perhaps the narrative has been expressed with reservation (Behbehani, 11/83). Allameh Mohammad Baqir behbahani has said this narrative has been expressed with reservation; because it firstly signifies that sacrificed animal of Harvari is lawful whereas Harvariha are involved in Navaseb and their sacrificed animal is certainly forbidden and none of companions of Imams believed that their sacrificed animal is allowed to eat. Secondly, the term not only isn't used about lawful but also this is a good indication that the tradition has been told with reservation (Behbehani, 53), (Javaheri, 36/96). Some traditions sometimes have been expressed with reservation. As Neyshabouri ruler has narrated that: a man wanted a permission to come to the Prophet (PBUH) and the Prophet said: "he is the worst tribesmen" but he allowed him to come to the Prophet and spoke to him; When the conversation ended and he came out of the Prophet's presence, they said to the Prophet: O Messenger of

[†] Nasebi: someone who is hostile to the family of Mohammad (PBUH) and insult them.

[‡] Harvari: Unlike some Muslims believe that doing mortal sin would lead to blasphemy.

Allah, you said that he is the worst tribesmen, but you welcomed him openly in this way? The Prophet said: The worst servant of God is the one whom somebody is not pleasant with his companionship because of his swearword (Nishapur, 8/21) (Rabbani, 2, 302).

5. Degrees of reservation

Kinds of reservations can be divided as follow in terms of duty:

1-Based on the logic of Shiite: reservation is obligatory in some circumstances (extermination of immediate loss)

2-In Some circumstances, it is unlawful (when the reservation causes more important issue to be abandoned and humans should not have reservation due to excuse that his life and property is endangered. Some people think that reservation is absolutely obligatory based on Shiite's opinion whereas it is a misconception and Shiite leaders do not follow this method. Because considering the situation, conditions, interests and corruption, they choose the appropriate way at any time and so we see that they sometimes left reservation and even sacrificed their lives and their own property in the way of expressing opinion. Basically Shia innocent leaders have often been martyred by sword or injustice of enemies. While if they were eloquent and affable with the rulers of that time, they certainly would give them the best posts but they knew well the reservation (for example against Yazid) causes the destruction of religion. The reservation about wine and anointing the foot with a shoe is prohibited (Marouh Al-hasani, 339).

3- Recommended reservation: stopping gradual loss

4- Permissible reservation: when the reservation is the same as lack of reservation

5- Abominable reservation: When leaving the reservation and tolerating its loss is better (Ansari, 39)

6. Removal of accusation from Shiites' claim in the permission of reservation

Despite expressing hadith in the conditions in which the reservation was necessary to preserve the benefits of the Shia and Shia traditions, it has had adverse effects on Shia traditions and it has created some problems such as:

1-Perplexity in doing religious duty: One of the results of expressing Hadith in the condition of reservation is the confliction of some traditions as a result of lack of access to fatwa and true judgment of an imam in a religious duty. This was the problem of the times of imams; especially the Age of Sadeqin (As) for some of the Shiites but this problem was favorably resolved by imams' intelligence.

2-Decreasing and increasing religious Texts: Another harmful consequence of the suppression against the Shiites is the loss of much of the hadith texts complexity. Because the companions of the

Imams and their works have frequently been attacked by enemies and some of the Shiites have lost some of their works and writings in addition to their martyrdom. In the era of Umayyeh, when hadith hadn't been written yet, Moaviyeh and caliphs after him tried to conceal the virtues of Ahlul Bayt (AS) and tried to cause hadith not to be written and narrated. Some narratives were also forged against Ali (AS) and his family at that time (Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 12/44). But in the era of Imam Baqir (AS), when Shia Hadith was written and rapidly developed, the opponents decided to destruct the works of Shiite or wanted to manipulate the complexities of hadith. As far as it relates to Umayyeh and Bni-Abbas, Shia hadith has frequently been attacked by the politicians; if Imams and their companions didn't sacrifice themselves, there might not be anything from Shia religion. According to contemporary researcher, Seyed Mortaza Asgari in the book of Maalem-Al-madresatayn, burning books and library is one of the ways to hide the hadith of the Prophet (PBUH) and his ; he believes that this experience dates back to the second caliph (Asgari, 1/291).

3-Perplexity in recognition of the fact: Expressing Hadith in the condition of reservation has addressed the charge of contradiction to Imams and caused them to doubt on their legitimacy. For example, Nobakhti has mentioned in Feraq- Al-Shia that Umar-ibn riyah initially believed in Imamate of Imam Baqir (AS). But after a while, he and some of his companions turned away from Imam and this was because he asked a question from Imam Baqir and received no answer. After one year, he asked the same question again but unlike the previous question he received answer from him. Here Umar said to Imam: Your reply at this moment is unlike the answer that you expressed last year. Imam said: This is correct, but the answer which was given last year was with the reservation (Nobakhti, 64).

Benefits of expressing Hadith in the conditions of reservation: The most important benefit of expressing Hadith in the conditions of reservation is to have sincerity in the complexities of hadith, since the suppression against Shiites by Bani Umayyeh and Bani-Abbas led few people have a relationship with Imam except sincere and devoted individuals. Accordingly Shia hadith has secretly been expressed by these two Imams and after the narratives had been written by the companions, were transferred to the trustees of next classes. Imam Sadiq (AS) said about Zareh (one of the preservers of narratives): "without Zareh, narratives of my father and the works of prophecy would be lost" (Tousi, 12, 210). From the other side, narrators of Hadith met each other by recommendation of Imam Sadiq (AS) to retell Hadith of Muhammad's family (Majlesi, 5/202). These factors made Shia hadith safe from any risk of distortion. Therefore the factor of reservation is considered as the merit of Shiite that this feature does not exist in Sunni tradition.

Conclusion

1-Legitimacy and permission of reservation has a root in Qur'an and the method of the companions of the Prophet and his confirmation is clear evidence that reservation has been existed at the beginning era of Islam and thus it has been continued at the times of infallible Imams.

2-Reservation will be continued until the time of Imam Mahdi (as), when he comes again, divine right is restored and there is no need of reservation.

3-Despite a permission of reservation and recommending it to the Shiite, Imams never compromised with the cruel caliphs and rulers and they always fought with them.

4- Reservation strengthens the faithful individuals and their secrets and their plans against the unrighteous people.

5-Expressing traditions in the conditions of reservation cannot weaken Shiite traditions; rather it requires knowledge of Hadith, reasons of Hadith and recognition of the conditions of expressing traditions in the time of Imams by religious scholars. And retrieval ways of traditions which have been expressed in the conditions of reservation can be searched through paying careful attention to the comments and opinions of religious scholars and their writings. The most important rules of expressing tradition in the conditions of reservation are maintaining and strengthening of the works and heritage of the Shiite.

References

- Al-Jawahiri, Jvahir-al-kalam, research and suspension, Sheikh Abbas Al-quchani, Tehran, 1987, Daral-kutub al Eslami
- Anis Ibrahim et al, Al-mojam Al-vasyt, Tehran, Naser Khosro press
- attributed to Imam Hasan Askari (as), Tafsiral Al-amnsub ela Imam Al-asgari, Qom, Islamic Publications institution affiliated with the Society of Seminary Teachers of Qom, 1935
- Ayashi, Muhammad ibn Masoud, Tafsir Alyash, Tehran, printers of Seminary 1960
- Behboudi, M.B, Marefat Al-Hadith, Tehran, cultural and scientific press 1942
- Fakhr Razi, Mohamed ibn Omar, interpretation of Mafatih Alghayb, Beirut, Daralmarefat, Bita
- Hamu, Gozideh Kafi, Tehran, Scientific and Cultural press, 1943
- Hassani, H.M, Drasat Fi Hadith va Al-Mohaddessin, Beirut, Daralmarf Press, 1984
- Hemo, Ekhtiyar Marefat Al-rejal, suspended by Mir Damad, Rajai, Qom, Al-Bayt Institute, 1984
- Horr Ameli, Muhammad ibn Hassan, Vaseye Al-Shia, Qom, cultural and scientific press, 1989
- Kuleyni, Abu jafar Mohammad ibn yaqub, adequate principles (translation and commentary by Muhammad Baqir Kamrei and corrected by Muhammad Baqir Ali Akbar Ghaffari) Islamic Publications, 1959
- Majlesi, M.B, Bihar al-Anwar, Beirut, Alvafa' Institute, 1984
- Mamaqani Abdullah Meqbas al Hidaya fi Elma Alderayh, Qom, Institute of al-bait reduction ehya taras, 1991
- Masoudi, Abdul Hadi, a way of understanding the hadith, hadith University Press, 1959, first printing
- Mughniyeh, MJ, Shia and Alhakmoun, Beirut, Al Hilal Daralmaktabah 1984
- Nishaburi, M.M, Al-Jameal-sahiyh, Beirut, 1954
- Nobakhti, Hasan ibn Musa, Feraq al-Shia, Najaf, press Haideriyah, 1978
- Rabbani, M.H, pathology of Hadith, Qom, publisher Razavi 2010, First Edition
- Raghib Esfahani, Hussein ibn Muhammad, Almfrdat Fi Gharib al Quran, Beirut, Daralmrhf, third edition 2002
- Saduq, Muhammad ibn Ali, Maani Al- Akhbar, Qom, Institute of Al-nashr al-Eslami, 1941
- Tabarsi, Abu Ali Fazl ibn Hasan, Majmaal-Bayan Fi tafsyr Al Quran, Beirut, Lelmatbuat Al-elmy Institute, 1995
- Tabatabai, S.M.H, Al Mizan fi Tafsir al-Quran, Institute of Islamic Publishing, Qom, 1997
- The Holy Quran Translated by Fuladvand, M.M, Seminary, Qom, 2000, First Edition
- Tousi, Muhammad ibn Hasan, Tahzibal Ahkam fi sharh Al-moqnah, Tehran, Dar al-kutab al-Eslami, 1968
- Wahid Behbehani, Mohammad baqir ibn Mohammad, Majmaal Al-Borhan Al Faydah, in accordance with CD Almojam Alfeqhi, Lithograph 1886.